

Department of Politics

Course Outline

POLS 231 ST: Surveillance, Accountability and the Role of
New Zealand Intelligence and Security Agencies

Lecturer: Dr David Burke

Email: db387@cam.ac.uk

Tel: 479 5109

Office: 2S9 (second floor, Arts Building)

Office hour: Wednesday 5.00 – 6.00pm

Overview

Are security and intelligence agencies necessary for New Zealand? Are they sufficiently accountable in both legal and political terms to be compatible with New Zealand's democratic traditions? Security and intelligence agencies can often become agents of the government in promoting its political and economic purposes. They can, it is said, conduct surveillance operations against innocent citizens who have done nothing wrong and this is an abuse of power. Should legitimate protest ever be accepted as a legitimate target for the intelligence agencies? Moreover, security and intelligence agencies can often become independent power centres of their own, deciding their own priorities and targets for their operations.

This course examines the history of New Zealand's security and intelligence agencies from the Maori Wars to "The War on Terror" and the USA's policy of "rebalancing" towards Asia. Students will gain an insight into the workings of the security and intelligence agencies both in the domestic sphere and on the international stage. The common assumption is that New Zealand is too small and unimportant to be of great interest to hostile foreign-intelligence organisations. This course aims to lay that myth to rest.

Learning Outcomes

By the end of this course you should be able to:

- Develop a conceptual understanding of intelligence and security.
- Demonstrate an advanced understanding of intelligence and security agencies in New Zealand.
- Obtain the ability to critically evaluate the role of New Zealand intelligence and security service in the context of normative debates around their appropriate role.
- Use historical case studies to assess the ways in which the New Zealand intelligence and security agencies are held accountable in legal and political terms
- Evaluate the adequacy of different forms of accountability at a time the process of intelligence gathering and surveillance has been deeply affected by radical technological change
- Illustrate an enhanced understanding of the role of intelligence in national and international security through written work and oral communications.

Lecture programme:

1. The Missing Dimension. The British Empire and the rise of the secret world.
2. Missionaries, Spying, and the Maori Wars. Policing New Zealand in the nineteenth century.
3. "One Big Union". The "Red Scare" and Sedition 1896-1921.
4. New Zealand Defence Security and Military Intelligence 1914-1945, 1945-2009.
5. Redefining New Zealand's strategic role during The Cold War (1941-1991).
6. Sedition once more? The intelligence service and popular opposition to the Vietnam War; the intelligence service and the women's and Maori protest movements; the 1981 South African rugby tour of New Zealand.
7. The anti-nuclear protest movement and the *Rainbow Warrior* affair.
8. ECHELON. New Zealand's role in the international signals intelligence network.
9. *Footsteps Up The Hill*. The New Zealand Intelligence Community and Civil Liberties.
10. New Zealand, "The War on Terror", and combating serious international crime.

Preliminary Reading

Andrew, Christopher & Dilks, David., *The Missing Dimension: governments and intelligence communities in the Twentieth Century*. (London 1984)

Core texts

Hunt, Graeme, *Spies and Revolutionaries. A History of New Zealand Subversion* (2007). Farson, Gill, Pythian and Shapiro (eds.) *PSI Handbook of Global Security and Intelligence*. Vol.2

Essay Questions: Lectures 1 & 2

1. 'With rebellion in the air, and in the absence of government agents, missionaries became a prime source of intelligence.' Discuss.
2. 'Pakeha-Maori, many of whom were victims of British justice, provided invaluable intelligence on settler movements and shipments, acting as interpreters with traders and missionaries in the interests of Maori tribal power.' Discuss.
3. The withdrawal of British troops from New Zealand in 1864 marked the beginning of a New Zealand modern defence force and intelligence community. Discuss

Reading Questions 1-3:

Cowan, J., *The New Zealand Wars: A History of the Maori Campaigns and the Pioneering Period* 2 vols. (Wellington, 1966)

Cowan, J., *The Adventures of Kimble Bent: A Story of Wild Life in the New Zealand Bush* (Christchurch, 1911)

Bentley, T., *Pakeha Maori: The Extraordinary Story of Europeans Who Lived as Maori in Early New Zealand* (Penguin Books, Auckland, 1999)

Hunt, Graeme., *Spies and Revolutionaries. A History of New Zealand Subversion* (2007) Ch. 1

Essay Question: Lecture 3

1. By 1921 the New Zealand Police Force had become a de facto security intelligence organisation similar to the anti-radical division of the United States Department of Justice under Attorney-General A. Mitchell Palmer and J. Edgar Hoover. Discuss

Reading:

Baker, P.J., *King and Country Call: New Zealanders, Conscription and the Great War* (Auckland University Press, Auckland, 1988)

Dunstall, G., *A Policeman's Paradise? Policing a Stable Society 1918-1945. The History of Policing in New Zealand.* (Wellington 1999)

Hill, R.S., *The Modernisation of Policing in New Zealand 1886-1917. The History of Policing in New Zealand Volume Three* (Wellington 1999)

Pugsley, C.J., *The Fringe of Hell. New Zealanders and Military Discipline in the First World War* (Hodder & Staughton, Auckland, 1991)

Dunstall, G: 'Governments, the Police and the Left 1912-51' in *On The Left: Essays in Socialism in New Zealand*, University of Otago Press, Dunedin, 2002)

Hunt, Graeme: *Spies and Revolutionaries. A History of New Zealand Subversion* (2007) Chapters 4 & 5.

Morgan, T., *Reds: McCarthyism in Twentieth-Century America* (Random House, New York 2003)

Reid, N.E. *James Michael Liston: A Life* (Victoria University Press, Wellington 2006)

Essay Question: Lecture 4

1. New Zealand forces abroad need good information about the threats, the geography, the people, the climate and the conditions they are likely to meet.' Discuss the development of an independent New Zealand military intelligence capability and its efficacy in the period 1914 – 1945.

Reading:

Alexander, Martin.S., (ed.) *Knowing your Friends: intelligence inside alliances and coalitions from 1914 to the Cold War.* (1988)

Comber, Leon., *Malaya's Secret Police 1945-1960: the role of the Special Branch in the Malayan Emergency.*

Crawford, John., *New Zealand's Pacific Frontline: Guadalcanal-Solomon Islands Campaign, 1942-45.*

Hager, N.A, *The Origins of Signals Intelligence in New Zealand* (Auckland 1995)

Stripp, Alan., *Codebreaker in the Far East.*

Tamke, Jurgen., 'Ruthless Warfare': *German Military Planning and Surveillance in the Australia-NZ Region before the Great War.*

Vaughan, D.L., *Report on Coastwatching Radio Stations in the Gilbert & Ellice Islands, 1941-5*

Winter, John., *Ultra in the Pacific: how breaking Japanese codes and ciphers affected naval operations against Japan 1941-5* (London 1993)

Essay Question: Lectures 4 & 5

1. An agency created at the navy's behest and with all the arrogance of MI5 and the British military establishment could muster.' To what extent did anti-British sentiment in New Zealand's security apparatus hinder the creation of a central intelligence service in New Zealand between 1939 and 1956?

Reading:

Alexander, Martin.S., (ed.) *Knowing your Friends: intelligence inside alliances and coalitions from 1914 to the Cold War*. (1988)

Comber, Leon., *Malaya's Secret Police 1945-1960: the role of the Special Branch in the Malayan Emergency*.

Hunt, Graeme., *Spies and Revolutionaries. A History of New Zealand Subversion*. Chs. 6 & 7.

Price, Hugh., *The Plot to Subvert Wartime New Zealand. A True Story of an Impudent Hoax that Convulsed New Zealand in the Darkest Days of World WarII, and that the Commissioner of Police declared 'Beyond Comprehension'. A Hoax, moreover, that Expanded to Challenge the Rule of Law in the Dominion.*' (Victoria University Press, Wellington, 2006)

Parker, Michael., *The SIS. The New Zealand Security Intelligence Service*. (Palmerston North, 1979)

Essay Questions: Lecture 5

1. By far the brightest New Zealand diplomat of his generation, and blessed with unrivalled linguistic skills, Paddy Costello proved to be a prime Soviet intelligence asset, as effective as the Cambridge Five. Discuss.
2. The Petrov and Sutch Affairs put New Zealand counter-intelligence on a professional footing. Discuss.
3. New Zealand remained a vital staging-post for espionage in Australasia and the South Pacific throughout the Cold War. Discuss.

Reading:

Andrew, C.M. and Mitrokhin, V.N., *The Mitrokhin Archive: The KGB in Europe and the West* (London 1999)

Bennets, C.H., *Spy: A Former SIS Officer Unmasks New Zealand's Cold War Spy Affair*. (Auckland 2006)

Costello, Patrick, *Mask of Treachery* (London 1988)

Gustafson, B.S., *His Way: A Biography of Robert Muldoon* (Auckland 2000)

Hall, Richard., *The Rhodes Scholar Spy* (Random house, Australia 1991)

Hunt, Graeme., *Spies and Revolutionaries. A History of New Zealand Subversion* (2007). Ch. 7

McNeish, J., *Dance of the Peacocks: New Zealanders in Exile at the Time of Hitler and Mao Tse-tung* (Auckland 2003)

Manne, R.M., *The Petrov Affair: Politics and Espionage* (Pergamon, Sydney, 1987)

Muldoon, R.D., *Muldoon* (Wellington 1977)

O'Sullivan, V.G. (ed.), *Intersecting Lines: The Memoirs of Ian Milner* (Wellington 1993)

Parker, M., *The SIS: The New Zealand Security Intelligence Service* (Palmerston North 1979)

Sinclair, K., *A History of the University of Auckland 1883-1983* (Auckland 1983)

Sinclair, K., *Walter Nash*

Templeton, M.J.C., *Top Hats Are Not Being Taken: A Short History of the New Zealand Legation in Moscow, 1944-1950* (Wellington 1989)

Trapeznik, A. & Fox A.P. (eds.), *Lenin's Legacy Down Under: New Zealand's Cold War*. (University of Otago Press, Dunedin, 2004)

Essay Questions Lectures 6-9

1. Muldoon had a strong relationship with the SIS – stronger probably than any previous prime minister – fuelling suspicion that the Service was a willing agent of the National Government.
2. 'Dissent in a democracy is healthy. But there are values of importance to the integrity of New Zealand that are protected by the security and intelligence agencies.' Discuss the New Zealand Secret Intelligence Service's monitoring of protest movements and political parties in New Zealand for the period 1956-1981, in the light of the above statement.
3. 'The DGSE succeeded in transforming a badly conceived plan into a disastrously mismanaged operation'. Discuss this assessment of the *Rainbow Warrior* affair.
4. The Government Communications Security Bureau has demonstrated greater loyalty to the UKUSA Security Agreement than to New Zealand. Discuss.
5. To what extent was the intelligence legislation introduced in the 1990's, aimed at guaranteeing democratic control of New Zealand's security services, undermined by the events of September 11 2001?

Reading Question 10:

Gustafson, B.S., *His Way: A Biography of Robert Muldoon* (Auckland 2000)

Hager, N., *The Hollow Men*

Hunt, Graeme., *Spies and Revolutionaries. A History of New Zealand Subversion* (2007)

Muldoon, R.D., *Muldoon* (Wellington 1977)

Parker, M., *The SIS: The New Zealand Security Intelligence Service* (Palmerston North 1979)

Sinclair, K., *A History of the University of Auckland 1883-1983* (Auckland 1983)

Reading Question 11:

Auckland District Law Society. Public Issues Committee, *The SIS Amendment Bill: more than just communications interception* (1977)

Bashier, Roger., *The Activities of the New Zealand Security Service. Variant Title: Footsteps up your Jumper*. (Wellington: Farm Road Branch, New Zealand Labour Party, 1969)

Beavis, John Graham., *The Powers and Functions of the New Zealand SIS*. (David Law Library, Call number: Thesis P3/3 BEA (1979))

Butterworth, S.M., *More Than Law and Order. Policing a Changing Society 1945-92. The History of Policing in New Zealand Volume Five*. (Wellington 2005)

Commission to inquire into Administration of Security Service so far as it Relates to Attendance of Officers at a University and Matters Incidental Thereto. (1966)

Fraser, George., *Seeing Red: Undercover in 1950's New Zealand*. (1995)

Gustafson, B.S., *His Way: A Biography of Robert Muldoon* (Auckland 2000)

Hunt, Graeme., *Spies and Revolutionaries. A History of New Zealand Subversion* (2007) Ch.10.

Muldoon, R.D., *Muldoon* (Wellington 1977)

New Zealand Council for Civil Liberties, *Report on the NZ Security Service Intelligence Act 1969*.

Parker, M., *The SIS: The New Zealand Security Intelligence Service* (Palmerston North 1979)

Sinclair, K., *A History of the University of Auckland 1883-1983* (Auckland 1983)

Security File 322.4409931 Polarisation and Fragmentation of the Anti-Springbok Rugby Tour Movement, prepared for R.D. Muldoon, 25 August 1981. (General Assembly Library, Wellington)
Templeton, M.J. C., *Human Rights and Sporting Contacts: New Zealand Attitudes to Race Relations in South Africa 1921-94* (Auckland 1998)

Reading Question 12:

Amery, Colin Lloyd., *Ten Minutes to Midnight* (Auckland 1989)
Danielsson, Bengt and Marie-Therese., *Poisoned reign: French Nuclear Colonialism in the Pacific*. (Penguin 1986)
Dyson, John., *Sink the Rainbow! An Enquiry into the "Greenpeace Affair"*. (Auckland 1986)
King, Michael., *Death of the Rainbow Warrior* (Penguin, 1986)
Porch, Douglas., *The French Secret Services. A History of French Intelligence from the Dreyfuss Affair to the Gulf War*. (New York 1995)
Sands, Alistair., *Rainbow Warrior affair and realism: a critique*. (Canberra 1991)
Sunday Times Insight Team., *The Rainbow Warrior: the French attempt to sink Greenpeace*. (London/Auckland 1986)

Reading Question 13:

Alexander, Martin.S., (ed.) *Knowing your Friends: intelligence inside alliances and coalitions from 1914 to the Cold War*. (1988)
Hager, N.A., *The Origins of Signals Intelligence in New Zealand* (Auckland 1995)
Hager, N.A., *Secret Power. New Zealand's Role in the International Spy Network* (Nelson 1996)
Hunt, Graeme., *Spies and Revolutionaries. A History of New Zealand Subversion* (2007)
New Zealand Office of the Inspector-General of Intelligence and Security, *Final Report on the Government Communications Security Bureau's internal rules for the collection and reporting of foreign communications and any adverse or improper impact on the privacy of New Zealand citizens*. (Wellington 1999)
Richelson, J.T., *The Ties that Bind: intelligence co-operation between UKUSA countries: UK, USA, CAN, Australia and NZ*. (1985)

Reading Question 14:

ALLIANCE, *Footsteps Up The Hill. The Lack of accountability in New Zealand's Security Services* (December 1997)
Brown, Andrew., *Jemaah Islamiyah: a threat to New Zealand?*
Conte, Alex., *Counter-terrorism and Human Rights in New Zealand*. (NZ Law foundation 2007)
Hager, N., *Secret Power* (Nelson, 1996)
Hunt, Graeme., *Spies and Revolutionaries. A History of New Zealand Subversion* (2007)
Securing Our Nation's Safety. How New Zealand manages its security and intelligence agencies. (Wellington 2000)
Mannin, B.S., Ryan, Y., and Small, K., *I Almost Forgot About the Moon: The Disinformation Campaign against Ahmed Zaoui*. (Auckland 2004)
New Zealand Audit office, *Managing Threats to Domestic Security* (2003)

Essay Questions Lecture 10

1. To what extent was the intelligence legislation introduced in the 1990's, aimed at guaranteeing democratic control of New Zealand's security services, undermined by the events of September 11 2001?
2. 'Warfare and crime are indistinguishable in a shadowy online world'. Discuss
3. 'Truth or Dare? The Edward Snowden saga fascinates but avoids some difficult questions'. Discuss.
4. Why did Snowden matter so much?

Reading Questions 15 and 16:

ALLIANCE, *Footsteps Up The Hall. The Lack of accountability in New Zealand's Security Services* (December 1997)

Brown, Andrew., *Jemaah Islamiyah: a threat to New Zealand?*

Conte, Alex., *Counter-terrorism and Human Rights in New Zealand*. (NZ Law foundation 2007)

Greenwald, Glenn, *No Place to Hide: Edward Snowden, the NSA and the Surveillance State*. (Hamish Hamilton, 2014)

Hager, N., *Secret Power* (Nelson, 1996)

Harding, Luke, *The Snowden Files: The Inside Story Of The World's Most Wanted Man*. (Guardian Faber, 2014)

Hunt, Graeme., *Spies and Revolutionaries. A History of New Zealand Subversion* (2007)

Securing Our Nation's Safety. How New Zealand manages its security and intelligence agencies. (Wellington 2000)

Mannin, B.S., Ryan, Y., and Small, K., *I Almost Forgot About the Moon: The Disinformation Campaign against Ahmed Zaoui*. (Auckland 2004)

New Zealand Audit office, *Managing Threats to Domestic Security* (2003)

Rid, Thomas, *Cyber War Will Not take Place* (2013)

Assessment Dates

Assessment	Weighting	Date
Essay 1 (2,000 – 2,500 words)	30%	TBC
Essay 2 (2,000 – 2,500 words)	30%	TBC
Final exam	40%	TBC